## Population synthesis of common-envelope mergers on the giant branches

Marc van der Sluys

University of Alberta, Edmonton / CITA


Mike Politano, Ron Taam, Bart Willems

## Outline



Introduction

- Stellar mergers
- Stellar collisions

2 Population-synthesis models

- Evolution of the binaries
- Merger process
(3) Population-synthesis results
- Properties of the merger populations
- Comparison to single-star populations
(4) Observational counterparts
- Formation of single sdB stars
- Li-rich giants
- Oblate stars
- Asymmetric planetary nebulae
(5) Conclusions and future work
- Conclusions
- Future work


## Stellar mergers

## Occurrence:

- Collisions: $\tau \sim$ day? (Sills et al. 2001)
- Binary mergers: convective envelope: $\tau \sim \tau_{\text {dyn }}$; yr - kyr?
- Binary mergers: radiative envelope: $\tau \sim \tau_{\text {th }} \rightarrow \tau_{\text {dyn }}$


HST

- A significant fraction of stars ( $\sim 10 \%$ ?) may be involved in mergers
- Luminous red novae?
- V 838 Mon?


## Merger products

## Physics:

- Angular momentum !
- Rapid, differential rotation
- Enhanced mixing
- Magnetic fields
- Enhanced mass loss



## Merger products

## Physics:

- Angular momentum !
- Rapid, differential rotation
- Enhanced mixing
- Magnetic fields
- Enhanced mass loss



## Merger products

## Observability:

- Rapid rotation?
- Abundance anomalies?
- Circumstellar material
- Blue stragglers
- Cluster dynamics

- "Weird" binaries
- B[e] stars?
- Hot subdwarfs?
- Asymmetric PNe
- IMBHs?


## Detailed collisions


$1.75 M_{\odot}$ : Collision product

Normal star (dashes): Fully mixed model

## Use:

- 1D stellar models
- collide them in hydro
- bring remnant in hydrostatic equilibrium
- evolve in 1D
- for low-mass stars: "Entropy" "sorting"


## Differences in:

- Timescales
- Luminosities
- Core masses
- Mixing


## Input models

Stellar-evolution code ev (Eggleton, 1971,2, etc.):

- 116: single-star models: 0.5, 0.6, ..., 10.0, 10.5, ..., 20.0 $M_{\odot}$ (primary, merger remnant)
- 28 brown-dwarf models: 0.01 $0.60 \mathrm{M}_{\odot}$ (secondary)
- Solar composition; $\mathrm{X}=0.70, \mathrm{Y}=0.28$, $\mathrm{Z}=0.02$



## Input models

## Stellar-evolution code ev:

- Core mass: $M_{c} \equiv$ central region where $X<0.1$
- Envelope binding energy: $E_{\text {bind }} \equiv \int_{M_{c}}^{M_{s}}\left(E_{\text {int }}(m)-\frac{G m}{r(m)}\right) \mathrm{d} m$
- Convective mixing: $I / H_{P}=2.0$
- Overshooting: none for $M<1.2 M_{\odot}, \delta_{\text {ov }}=0.12$ for $M \geq 1.2 M_{\odot}$
- Stellar wind: "Reimers" (1975), De Jager et al. (1988)
- Helium-flash-avoidance routine FGB2HB


## Treatment of evolution

## Stars

- Constant star-formation rate
- Randomly select $10^{7}$ binaries:
- $M_{\mathrm{p}}$ : Miller-Scalo IMF
- $q \equiv M_{\mathrm{s}} / M_{p}$ :

$$
g(q) \mathrm{d} q=\left\{q^{-0.9}, 1, q\right\} \mathrm{d} q
$$

- Follow the evolution of track closest in mass to primary
- When mass comes closer to next track, jump with conservation of $M_{c}$



## Treatment of evolution

## Stars

- Constant star-formation rate
- Randomly select $10^{7}$ binaries:
- $M_{\mathrm{p}}$ : Miller-Scalo IMF
- $q \equiv M_{\mathrm{s}} / M_{\mathrm{p}}$ :
$g(q) \mathrm{d} q=\left\{q^{-0.9}, 1, q\right\} \mathrm{d} q$
- Follow the evolution of track closest in mass to primary
- When mass comes closer to
 next track, jump with conservation of $M_{c}$


## Treatment of evolution

## Orbit

- Assume synchronous rotation on RGB, AGB: $\omega_{\mathrm{p}}=\omega_{\text {orb }}$
- Mass and AM loss from stellar wind
- If $v_{\text {rot }}>v_{\text {crit }}$ : lose additional mass and AM until $v_{\text {rot }} \leq v_{\text {crit }}$
- Redistribute AM, so that $J_{\text {tot }}=\left(I_{\mathrm{p}}+I_{\text {orb }}\right) \omega_{\text {orb }}$
- $v_{\text {crit }} \equiv\{0.1,1 / 3,1.0\} v_{\text {br }}$


## Common envelope and spiral-in

- CE occurs when:
- $R_{\mathrm{p}}>R_{\mathrm{RL}, \mathrm{p}}$ and $q>q_{\text {crit }}\left(M_{\mathrm{p}}, M_{\mathrm{c}}\right)$ (Hurley et al. 2002)
- $J_{\text {prim }}>\frac{1}{3} J_{\text {orb }}($ Darwin 1879)
- Classical energy formalism to determine post-CE orbit (Webbink 1984):

$$
E_{\mathrm{bind}}=\alpha_{\mathrm{CE}}\left(\frac{G M_{\mathrm{p}} M_{\mathrm{s}}}{2 a_{\mathrm{i}}}-\frac{G M_{\mathrm{c}} M_{\mathrm{s}}}{2 a_{\mathrm{f}}}\right)
$$

- $\alpha_{\mathrm{CE}}=\{0.1,0.5,1.0\}$
- Merger occurs if after CE: $R_{\mathrm{RL}, \mathrm{s}}<R_{\mathrm{s}}$


## Merger process

## The merger product has:

- the core mass of the original primary
- the maximum mass for which:
- the star is spinning (sub-)critically ( $v_{\text {rot }} \leq V_{\text {orit }}$ )
- $M_{\text {mrg }} \leq M_{p}+M_{s}$
- the evolutionary state of the primary, or later


## In addition,

- the surplus mass from the binary does not interact with the star (accretion, tides)


## Evolution of the merger product

## After the merger:

- the merger product evolves mostly in the same way as a normal single star
- e.g. L, R, etc. are identical to those for a star with the same $M, M_{c}$
- difference: $v_{\text {rot }}$, hence $\dot{M}$
- whenever $v_{\text {rot }} \geq v_{\text {crit }}$, the star undergoes enhanced mass loss, to ensure that it remains spinning sub-critically
- this is especially important around core helium ignition



## Population-synthesis results

|  | Number | Fraction of previous group | Fraction of initial population |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Total binary population: | 10,000,000 | 100\% | 100\% |
| No MT | 7,094,523 | 71\% | 71\% |
| Stable MT | 1,267,854 | 13\% | 13\% |
| Unstable MT: | 1,637,623 | 16\% | 16\% |
| CE Survivors: | 789,807 | 48\% | - 7.9\% |
| Mergers: | 847,816 | 52\% | 8.5\% |
| Mergers due to RLOF | 689,815 | 81\% | 6.9\% |
| Mergers due to tidal capture | 158,001 | 19\% | 1.6\% |
| Mergers on RGB | 738,385 | 87\% | 7.4\% |
| Mergers on AGB | 109,431 | 13\% | 1.1\% |
| WDs | 822,773 | 97\% | 8.2\% |
| GB/HB stars: | 25,041 | 3\% | 0.25\% |
| RGB | 9,301 | 37\% | 0.09\% |
| HB | 14,305 | 57\% | 0.14\% |
| AGB | 1,435 | 6\% | 0.01\% |
| Critically rotating RGB stars | 297 | 3.2\% | 0.003\% |
| Critically rotating HB stars | 4,504 | 31\% | 0.05\% |
| Critically rotating AGB stars | 1 | 0.1\% | 0.00001\% |

## Merger properties

Total mass:


## Luminosity:



AGB

$$
v_{\text {crit }}=\frac{1}{3} v_{\mathrm{br}}
$$

## Merger population

All merger products:


Merger products on HB:


$$
v_{\text {crit }}=\frac{1}{3} v_{\text {br }}
$$

## Rotational velocities

$$
\mathbf{v}_{\text {rot }} / \mathbf{v}_{\text {crit }} \text { : }
$$

## $\mathbf{v}_{\text {rot }}(\mathrm{km} / \mathbf{s}):$




$$
v_{\text {crit }}=\frac{1}{3} v_{\text {br }}
$$

## Rotational velocities

## $\mathbf{V}_{\text {rot }} / \mathbf{v}_{\text {crit }}$ :


$\mathbf{v}_{\mathrm{rot}} \sin \mathrm{i}(\mathrm{km} / \mathbf{s}):$


$$
v_{\text {crit }}=\frac{1}{3} v_{\mathrm{br}}
$$

## Sub-populations

| Population | N | $\frac{\mathrm{N}}{\mathrm{N}_{\text {tot }}}$ | $\begin{gathered} \mathbf{M} \\ \left(\mathbf{M}_{\odot}\right) \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} v \sin i \\ (\mathrm{~km} / \mathrm{s}) \end{gathered}$ | Fraction with |  | $\begin{gathered} M_{\mathrm{rej}} \\ \left(\mathbf{M}_{\odot}\right) \\ \hline \hline \end{gathered}$ | $\frac{M_{\mathrm{rej}}}{M_{\mathrm{bin}}}$ | $\frac{\Delta M_{\mathrm{mrg}}}{\mathrm{M}_{\mathrm{mrg}, \mathrm{i}}}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  |  | $\begin{gathered} \mathbf{v}_{\mathrm{rot}} \leq \\ 0.1 \mathbf{v}_{\text {crit }} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \mathbf{v}_{\text {rot }}= \\ \mathbf{v}_{\text {crit }} \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ |  |  |  |
| RGB | 9301 | 0.37 | 1.20 | 18.4 | (0.001) | 0.0319 | 0.63 | 0.34 | 0.00 |
| HB | 14305 | 0.57 | 1.35 | 16.1 | (0.0000) | 0.3149 | 0.93 | 0.40 | 0.12 |
| AGB | 1435 | 0.06 | 1.34 | 6.0 | 0.0683 | (0.0007) | 0.94 | 0.42 | 0.13 |
| Total | 25041 | - 1.00 | 1.28 | $16.2$ | 0.0043 | 0.1918 | 0.81 | 0.38 | 0.07 |

## Dependence on input parameters

| Model | N | $\frac{N_{\mathrm{RGB}}}{N_{\text {tot }}}$ | $\begin{gathered} \mathbf{M} \\ \left(\mathbf{M}_{\odot}\right) \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | $\mathrm{v} \sin \mathbf{i}$ <br> (km/s) | Fraction with |  | $\begin{gathered} \mathbf{M}_{\mathrm{rej}} \\ \left(\mathbf{M}_{\odot}\right) \end{gathered}$ | $\frac{M_{\mathrm{rej}}}{M_{\mathrm{bin}}}$ | $\frac{\Delta M_{\mathrm{mg}}}{M_{\mathrm{mrg}, \mathrm{i}}}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  |  | $\begin{gathered} \mathbf{v}_{\text {rot }} \leq \\ \mathbf{0 . 1} \mathbf{v}_{\text {crit }} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \mathbf{v}_{\text {rot }}= \\ \mathbf{v}_{\text {crit }} \end{gathered}$ |  |  |  |
| $\alpha_{\text {CE }}=0.1$ | 32882 | 0.29 | 1.23 | 16.5 | 0.0054 | 0.2726 | 0.83 | 0.40 | 0.10 |
| $\alpha_{\text {CE }}=0.5$ | 28269 | 0.34 | 1.23 | 16.2 | 0.0048 | 0.2201 | 0.81 | 0.38 | 0.08 |
| $\alpha_{\text {CE }}=1.0$ | 25041 | 0.37 | 1.28 | 16.2 | 0.0043 | 0.1918 | 0.81 | 0.38 | 0.07 |

## Common-envelope parameter

- for a larger $\alpha_{\mathrm{CE}}$, a smaller fraction of all CEs leads to merger
- for a smaller $\alpha_{\mathrm{CE}}$, wider binaries can merge
- merger remnants have more angular momentum


## Dependence on input parameters

| Model | N | $\frac{N_{\mathrm{RGB}}}{N_{\text {tot }}}$ | $\begin{gathered} \mathbf{M} \\ \left(\mathbf{M}_{\odot}\right) \end{gathered}$ | $v \sin i$ <br> (km/s) | Fraction with |  | $\begin{gathered} \mathbf{M}_{\mathrm{rej}} \\ \left(\mathbf{M}_{\odot}\right) \end{gathered}$ | $\frac{M_{\mathrm{rej}}}{\mathrm{M}_{\mathrm{bin}}}$ | $\frac{\Delta M_{\mathrm{mrg}}}{\mathbf{M}_{\mathrm{mrg}, \mathrm{i}}}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  |  | $\begin{gathered} \mathbf{v}_{\text {rot }} \leq \\ \mathbf{0 . 1} \mathbf{v}_{\text {crit }} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \mathbf{v}_{\text {rot }}= \\ \mathbf{v}_{\text {crit }} \end{gathered}$ |  |  |  |
| $g(q)=q^{-0.9}$ | 25343 | 0.35 | 1.29 | 16.3 | 0.0045 | 0.2012 | 0.28 | 0.18 | 0.07 |
| $g(q)=1$ | 25041 | 0.37 | 1.28 | 16.2 | 0.0043 | 0.1918 | 0.81 | 0.38 | 0.07 |
| $g(q)=q$ | 24853 | 0.36 | 1.29 | 16.0 | 0.0049 | 0.2015 | 1.10 | 0.46 | 0.07 |

## Initial-mass-ratio distribution

- $g(q)=q$ favours equal-mass binaries, $g(q)=q^{-0.9}$ favours extreme mass ratios
- For $g(q)=q$, secondary masses are larger and more mass is rejected during the merger


## Dependence on input parameters

| Model | N | $\frac{N_{\mathrm{RGB}}}{N_{\mathrm{tot}}}$ | $\begin{gathered} \mathbf{M} \\ \left(\mathbf{M}_{\odot}\right) \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & v \sin i \\ & (\mathrm{~km} / \mathrm{s}) \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ | Fraction with |  | $\begin{gathered} \mathbf{M}_{\mathrm{rej}} \\ \left(\mathrm{M}_{\odot}\right) \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | $\frac{M_{\mathrm{rej}}}{M_{\mathrm{bin}}}$ | $\frac{\Delta M_{\mathrm{mrg}}}{\mathrm{M}_{\mathrm{mrg}, \mathrm{i}}}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  |  | $\begin{gathered} \mathbf{v}_{\text {rot }} \leq \\ \mathbf{0 . 1} \mathbf{v}_{\text {crit }} \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \mathbf{v}_{\text {rot }}= \\ \mathbf{v}_{\text {crit }} \end{gathered}$ |  |  |  |
| $v_{\text {crit }}=0.1 v_{\text {br }}$ | 25490 | 0.38 | 1.20 | 4.6 | 0.0058 | 0.1974 | 0.90 | 0.41 | 0.08 |
| $v_{\text {crit }}=\frac{1}{3} v_{\text {br }}$ | 25041 | 0.37 | 1.28 | 16.2 | 0.0043 | 0.1918 | 0.81 | 0.38 | 0.07 |
| $v_{\text {crit }}=V_{\text {br }}$ | 24414 | 0.33 | 1.46 | 47.7 | 0.0051 | 0.1343 | 0.63 | 0.30 | 0.02 |

## Critical rotational velocity

- The observed (projected) rotational velocity scales with our definition of $v_{\text {crit }}$
- For smaller $v_{\text {crit }}$, more mass is ejected during and after merger


## Comparison to single stars

Merger remnants:

## Single stars:




$$
v_{\text {crit }}=\frac{1}{3} v_{\mathrm{br}}
$$

## Comparison to single stars

| Ev. phase | population | N | $\frac{\mathrm{N}}{\mathrm{N} \text { tot }}$ | $\begin{gathered} \mathbf{M} \\ \left(\mathbf{M}_{\odot}\right) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} v \sin i \\ (\mathrm{~km} / \mathrm{s}) \end{gathered}$ | Fraction with |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  |  |  | $\begin{gathered} \mathbf{v}_{\text {rot }} \leq \\ \mathbf{0 . 1} \mathbf{v}_{\text {crit }} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \mathbf{v}_{\text {rot }}= \\ \mathbf{v}_{\text {crit }} \end{gathered}$ |
| RGB | mergers | 9301 | 0.37 | 1.20 | 18.4 | (0.001) | 0.0319 |
|  | single | 178651 | 0.61 | 1.20 | 1.9 | 0.9627 | 0.000 |
| HB | mergers | 14305 | 0.57 | 1.35 | 16.1 | (0.0000) | 0.3149 |
|  | single | 104979 | 0.36 | 1.58 | 3.2 | 0.0886 | 0.0021 |
| AGB | mergers | 1435 | 0.06 | 1.34 | 6.0 | 0.0683 | (0.0007) |
|  | single | 10487 | 0.04 | 1.45 | 1.3 | 0.5657 | (0.0000) |
| Total | mergers | 25041 | 1.00 | 1.28 | 16.2 | 0.0043 | 0.1918 |
|  | single | 294117 | 1.00 | 1.23 | 2.3 | 0.6366 | 0.0008 |

## Critical rotational velocity

- The observed (projected) rotational velocity is roughly an order of magnitude larger for merger products
- Most merger products on the GBs have ignited helium, most normal single stars have not


## sdB stars

## Basic properties:

- Core helium burning stars with very thin ( $\lesssim 0.02 \mathrm{M}_{\odot}$ ) hydrogen-rich envelope
- In the field ~ 40-70\% are found in binaries
- In GCs mostly observed as single sdB stars
- Masses observed $\sim 0.39 M_{\odot}-0.7 M_{\odot}$ (e.g. asteroseismology)



## sdB stars

## Possible formation channels:

In wide binaries:

- One or two phases of stable Roche-lobe overflow

In close binaries:

- One or two CE/spiral-in phases


## Single sdB stars:

- He-WD-He-WD mergers ( $M \gtrsim 0.4 M_{\odot}$ )
- Strong mass loss at tip of RGB (e.g. capture of planet; Soker \& Harpaz, 2000, 2007; Livio \& Siess, 1999a,b)
- CE merger on the RGB (Soker 1998, Soker \& Harpaz 2000, 2007)


## Rotational velocities for merged HB stars

## All merger products:



Merger products on HB:


$$
v_{\text {crit }}=\frac{1}{3} v_{\mathrm{br}}
$$

## Rotational velocities

## $\mathbf{V}_{\text {rot }} / \mathbf{v}_{\text {crit }}$ :



Merger products
$\mathbf{v}_{\text {rot }}(\mathbf{k m} / \mathbf{s}):$


Single stars

$$
v_{\text {crit }}=\frac{1}{3} v_{\mathrm{br}}
$$

## Core and envelope masses

Helium-core masses:


Helium-core mass at present epoch $\left(M_{\odot}\right)$

Envelope masses:


Single stars

## Losing the envelope

Detailed model of an HB star with initial parameters $\mathbf{M} \approx 0.59 \mathrm{M}_{\odot}$, $\mathrm{M}_{\text {env }} \approx 0.11 \mathrm{M}_{\odot}$ and $\mathrm{v}_{\text {rot }} \approx 25 \mathrm{~km} / \mathrm{s}:$
$M_{\text {env }}$ vs. $\log R$ :


$M_{\text {env }}$ vs. $V_{\text {rot }}$ :

## Lithium-rich giants

Reddy \& Lambert 2005; Kumar \& Reddy 2009:

| Star | $[\mathrm{Fe} / \mathrm{H}]$ | $\mathrm{T}_{\text {eff }}$ |  |  |  |  |  | $M \star / M_{\odot}$ | $\log L / L_{\odot}$ | $\log \epsilon(\mathrm{Li})$ | ${ }^{12} \mathrm{C} /{ }^{13} \mathrm{C}$ |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| HD 77361 | $-0.02 \pm 0.1$ | $4580 \pm 75$ | $1.5 \pm 0.2$ | $1.66 \pm 0.1$ | $3.82 \pm 0.10$ | $4.3 \pm 0.5$ |  |  |  |  |  |
| HD 233517 | -0.37 | $4475 \pm 70$ | $1.7 \pm 0.2$ | $2.0^{a}$ | $4.22 \pm 0.11$ | $\ldots$ |  |  |  |  |  |
| IRAS 13539-4153 | -0.13 | $4300 \pm 100$ | $0.8 \pm 0.7$ | $1.60^{a}$ | $4.05 \pm 0.15$ | 20 |  |  |  |  |  |
| HD 9746 | -0.06 | $4400 \pm 100$ | $1.92 \pm 0.3$ | 2.02 | $3.75 \pm 0.16$ | $28 \pm 4$ |  |  |  |  |  |
| HD 19745 | -0.05 | $4700 \pm 100$ | $2.2 \pm 0.6$ | $1.90^{\mathrm{a}}$ | $3.70 \pm 0.30$ | $16 \pm 2$ |  |  |  |  |  |
| IRAS 13313-5838 | -0.09 | $4540 \pm 150$ | 1.1 | $1.85^{a}$ | $3.3 \pm 0.20$ | $12 \pm 2$ |  |  |  |  |  |




## Oblateness

MacLaurin spheroids (1742):
Zhao et al. 2009

$$
\frac{\omega}{\sqrt{2 \pi G \rho}}=\sqrt{\frac{\sqrt{1-e^{2}}}{e^{3}}}\left(3-2 e^{2}\right) \operatorname{asin}(e)-\frac{3}{e^{2}}\left(1-e^{2}\right)
$$



$$
e \equiv \sqrt{1-\left(R_{\mathrm{pol}} / R_{\mathrm{eq}}\right)^{2}}
$$



## Oblateness

Single stars


Merger products


## Asymmetric planetary nebulae?



Butterily nebula (HST)

## Conclusions

## Population-synthesis code:

- We produced an initial version of a code with which we can study large populations of merger remnants, albeit with simplified assumptions


## Results:

- Common-envelope mergers on the giant branches lead to rapidly rotating merger products
- Merger products through this channel rotate roughly $10 \times$ faster than normal single stars
- Roughly $60 \%$ of merger products have ignited helium; $\sim 40 \%$ of normal single stars have not
- In a population with $50 \%$ initial binaries, $\sim 3.4 \%$ of the single stars would be a GB merger remnant


## Conclusions

## sdB stars:

- Contraction of a merger product due to helium ignition provides a natural way to create rapidly rotating HB stars
- A small fraction of these HB stars have thin envelopes; these stars are close to becoming single sdB stars


## Other observables:

- Telltales of (former) rapid rotation may include abundance anomalies, small envelope mass, oblate stars, IR excess and asymmetric nebulae


## Future work

## To-do list

- Use more flexible implementation for mass loss due to winds and rotation
- Include magnetic braking for merger product
- Look for mechanism to remove last bit of HB-star envelope (perhaps on RGB?)
- Combine population synthesis and "entropy" "sorting":
- do population synthesis to get the mergers
- use entropy sorting to get a merger product
- interpolate to create an evolution model
- evolve it with a detailed stellar-evolution code (including rotation)

